REPORT

by

Dr. Heleno Claudio Fragoso, Brazil,

on

THE SITUATION OF DEFENCE LAWYERS IN ARGENTINA, March 1975
REPORT

by

Dr. Heleno Claudio Fragoso, Brazil,
on
THE SITUATION OF DEFENCE LAWYERS IN ARGENTINA, March 1975

INTRODUCTION:

1. In carrying out the mission with which I was entrusted, I went to Buenos Aires on March 3 last and stayed in that city until March 20. During that period of time I undertook my work on an intensive basis and was in contact with many lawyers of the most diverse political persuasions, amongst whom figured some of the most respected persons in our profession. I had interviews with the leaders and members of the representative institutions of the profession, the Buenos Aires Bar, the Buenos Aires Lawyers' Association, and the Federation of Bar Societies. I was also in contact with journalists, university professors and magistrates of differing degrees.

During my time in Buenos Aires I benefited from the full-time assistance of two diplomats who, in the name of the Argentine government, placed themselves at my disposal, thus facilitating by their great efficiency and courtesy all of the official contacts which I wished to establish. Thus I was able to meet with Minister of State and leaders of the National Congress who represented the various parties.

On the other hand, I undertook extensive research into the laws and executive decrees, judicial decisions and periodical collections. By this means I gained wide-ranging documentation on facts and events.

The following report is the result of this work. In it I shall examine firstly the position in which lawyers who engage in the defence of political detainees in present day Argentina find themselves. This position is one of the aspects of the process of political violence which the country is undergoing and concerning which, in the second part of the study, I shall present certain data.

***

S-3178 (a)
2. Those lawyers who act as defence counsel for political detainees have been victims of extensive violence, ranging from threats of murder to actual physical elimination. Several have had their offices damaged by explosions and broken into by police authorities. Some are detained on order of the Executive without any regular trial or the laying of formal charges. Others have had to leave the country or go into hiding, thus necessarily abandoning their professional activities.

3. The following lawyers are being detained at the pleasure of the Executive: Armando Rodolfo Fertita (1); Raúl Degue; Eduardo Romanin; Lucila F. Intelisano; Horacio D. Zamboni; Jorge J. Ballardini; Susana Aguad and Susana Buconic (2); Ricardo Amor (3); Oscar Pedota; Roberto Berges; Pablo LaJarraga; Carlos Masolo; Vicente V. Ayala (4); René Gabioux; Farat Sire Salim (5); Hector Andreotti; Cesar Calcagno; Julio C. Marcoli and Jorge N. Marca (6); Roberto Diaz; Abraham Kozak (7); Alfredo Ramon Guevara and Fuad Taum (8); Carlos Mariano Zamorano (9); Hector Archetti (10); Juan Bonacossi (11); Nestor Bueno (12); Julio Evert Suarez (13); Eduardo Garat (14); Daniel Veiga (15); Andrés Fidalgo and Amalio Juan Rey.

Many consider this list incomplete. On it, however, figures the great majority of defence advocates of political prisoners who were practising at the time of their arrest. (16)

On December 16, 1974, a representative committee of the Movement for the Protection of the Legal Profession submitted a memorandum to the Supreme Court of Justice in which it petitioned the Court to request "the Executive to explain the grounds on which a number of lawyers had been taken into custody". In this memorandum were mentioned the names of several lawyers referred to above and it was stated that "they were not charged with any specific criminal acts". (17)

Some 250 militant lawyers of the court in Cordoba recently had published an open letter to the President of the country and to the Minister of the Interior, calling for the release of Susana Aguad, Susana Buconic, Abraham Kozak and Amalio Rey, all of whom had been kept arbitrarily under arrest for more than three months. (18)

4. The following lawyers have, amongst others, been threatened with murder by the terrorist organisation AAA ("Argentine Anti-Communist Alliance"): Mario Hernandez, Osvaldo Acosta, Eduardo Duhalde, Vicente Zito Lema, Ana Maria Sanchez, Ines Gassibe, Helena Moreno, Eduardo A. Sanjurjo, Manuel Gaggero, Rodolfo Matarollo, Enrique Schargorodsky, Gustavo Roca, Lucia Garzon Maceda, Carlos Altamira, Rafael Lombardi, Alfredo Becerra, Carlos Bongiorno, Mario Mathov, Rafael Cecilio Hasovich, Mario Landaburu, Antonio Chua, Mario Yacub, Amilcar and Manuela Santucho, Jorge Sivak and Horacio Ramiro Vivas.
Several of these lawyers had distinguished themselves in their defence of political detainees, activities which they have now had to abandon. Some are in hiding after having had to go so far as to change their physical appearance. Some of these attorneys were contacted by me.

5. Several lawyers had their offices broken into. This is the case of Alicia Pierini, Pedro Galin and Alejandro Teitelbaum. Earlier the offices of Mava Menvielle, Marta Dacunda, Eugenio Laera, Silvio Frondizi and Antonio Sosa - all defence counsel for political detainees - were also forcibly entered. (19)

On May 10, 1974, the law offices of Miguel Zavala Rodriguez, Member of Congress, in Mar del Plata were broken into by agents of the Provincial and Federal Police. (20) Shortly after the funeral of Rodolfo Ortega Peña, the homes of several attorneys were forcibly entered by Federal Police. Amongst these were Carlos Gonzalez Gartland and Mario Hernández. (21)

6. More serious attacks have also taken place. The Guild of Attorneys of the Federal Capital had its head office completely destroyed by plastic explosives which caused injuries to four passers-by. This occurred on July 17, 1974. The Guild had called a meeting of defence counsel of political prisoners and workers. One of its officers stated that several threats had been made by a commando named Juan Manuel de Rosas. (22)

The Bar Association of Bahia Blanca's headquarters was the victim of an attack with explosives and shooting shortly after the Association had decided that its members would thereafter be designated as defence counsel for political detainees by the drawing of lots, since it was impossible for those lawyers chosen by the accused to assume such a responsibility. Those whose names were drawn had their homes bombed and were subsequently arrested. The Bar Association in Tucumán was also the target of an attack after having published a document protesting against assaults which had been made on lawyers. Its headquarters were completely destroyed after having been twice dynamited. (23)

The offices and homes of many lawyers have been attacked by bombs and rifle fire. This has happened to Attorneys Carlos A. Gonzalez Gartland and Saul Lipovetsky (in October 1974) as well as to Attorneys Vicente Zito Lema and Miguel A. Radrizzani Coñi. In a document issued in the name of the defence counsel for guerrilla fighters arrested in Catamarca, Dr. Silvio Frondizi and Dr. Manuel Gaggero denounced "interference and all types of intimidation to which counsel undertaking to defend those arrested were subjected. In the case of Dr. Marcoli, the Provincial Governor of Catamarca required him to resign from public office and he was threatened if he did not comply. His home was, moreover, forcibly broken into by the Federal Security Agency's agents. The home of Dr. Martinelli, barrister in Tucumán, was destroyed by explosives and Drs. Curutchet and Perez were taken into custody when the hotel in which they were staying the night was broken into."

The same Dr. Silvio Frondizi (who was later murdered) had his office destroyed by a bomb on August 30, 1974. (24) The home of Attorney Amado Nelson Machado of Rosario who was making grave accusations against the police of the district of Villa Mugueta at the time, was attacked by a hail of machine-gun fire. (25)

7. After being repeatedly threatened, Attorneys Pedro Galin (26), Mario Diehl, Rafael J. Perez, Alejandro Teitelbaum, E. Nogueras, Oscar Rabinovich,
Mirta Sofia and Carlos A. Gonzalez Gartland, have left the country.

8. The culminating point of this violence directed against lawyers was reached with the dramatic death of several of them.

Before 1973 the only case on record was that of Nestor Martins, captured as he was leaving his office on December 16, 1970, accompanied by his client, Nildo Zenteno. Martins had denounced several policemen for torture and was engaged at the time in proving the truth of his allegations in court. Nothing more has ever been heard either of the lawyer or of his client. There is no doubt that they are dead. (27)

The death of Nestor Martins belongs, however, to the past. The current political history of Argentina begins with the taking of office by President Campora on May 25, 1973, in the midst of delirious demonstrations on the part of the people. From that date on, there are the following cases on record:

(a) the murder of Antonio Deleroni, defence counsel for political detainees and "Peronista" militant, and of his companion, Nélida Florentina Arana, took place on November 27, 1973, in the city of San Miguel. Deleroni had been outstanding in his defence of political prisoners under the military régime and had recently denounced police torture carried out in the police station of San Miguel. (28)

According to the reports in various periodicals, the crime took place in San Miguel railway station, shortly after 4.00 p.m. As the couple was preparing to enter the train, they were intercepted by a youth who got out of a car in which were five other persons. Deleroni's companion, upon realising their criminal purpose, placed herself in front of him and was shot several times. Then Deleroni himself was repeatedly short and died instantly.

Two policemen who were in a train went off in pursuit of the criminal and managed to apprehend and disarm him. He was discovered to be Ricardo Julio Villanueva, 27 years of age, who declared that he was a member of the (Peronist) Partido Justicialista, and gave his address as the Superior School of Political Leadership in the capital. The latter organisation is connected with the powerful metal workers' union (UOM) and occupies an important position in the "Peronista" Superior Council. In a previous action brought against Villanueva for the possession of weapons of war, he requested the return of his personal belongings on a piece of paper with the letter-head of the Peronist Youth of the Republic of Argentina, and stated that he was an official of the Ministry of Social Welfare. (29)

(b) On July 31, 1974, at a place in the centre of the city of Buenos Aires at about 10.30 p.m., a Member of Congress, Rodolfo Ortega Peña, was shot as he was getting out of a taxi with his wife. He had distinguished himself as an exceptionally energetic defence counsel for political detainees. The crime occurred as the Member of Congress was getting out of a taxi with his wife. Three men armed with machine guns shot him in several places in the head and body. His wife was wounded also, although not seriously. The murderers got away and there has been no news on the results of the investigation. (30) His funeral was a gigantic popular demonstration, severely repressed by armed
federal police in armoured cars and on motorcycles. They staged raids, even inside the cemetery, and made 380 arrests. (31) The following day the Ministry of the Interior issued a communiqué stating that "in view of the continual disorders which took place during the procession (of mourners), 380 persons had been arrested, of whom 303 were tried for contempt, illegal possession of arms and mischievous damage. The rest were released since they were minors." (32)

The demonstrators carried placards on which was inscribed the old "Peronista" motto "La Sangre derramada no será negociada" ("There shall be no bargaining with blood that has been shed").

At the commemorative session of the Chamber of Representatives, Rep. Merchensky (FREJULI) a political party, the Frente Justicialista de Liberación - Trans. stated: "The protection and the safety of Argentineans are imperilled as they have never been before in our history." (33)

c) On September 11, 1974, while returning from the distant town of Rio Gallegos where he had been visiting political prisoners, Alfredo Curutchet, a 34-year old lawyer from Córdoba, was kidnapped and murdered. Previously his home had been the target of bombings and machine-gun fire. The funeral took place in Córdoba. The criminals used a green Ford Falcon. (34) Para-police groups were directly responsible for the crime. (35) The investigations have led to no results.

d) On September 27, 1974, Dr. Silvio Frondizi was kidnapped from his son-in-law's home in a spectacular commando-type operation. He was later found dead in the Ezeiza Recreation Centre. Silvio Frondizi was the brother of a former President of Argentina and an active defender of political prisoners.

The kidnapping took place in the early afternoon in a busy Buenos Aires street and involved a number of persons. Traffic was stopped in the neighbourhood for fifteen minutes and no-one in authority intervened. The lawyer's son-in-law, Mr. Luis Mendiburu, was killed by machine-gun fire when he tried to protect his father-in-law. Frondizi's wife and a neighbour were wounded. The AAA claimed responsibility for the acts. Although the murderers made their getaway in a Ford Falcon with a flat tyre, the investigations undertaken have yielded no results up to now. (36)

e) Two young women lawyers from Santa Fe, Marta Zamase and Niña Urquia, 32 and 22 years of age respectively, were found choked to death in a small creek near the town. They had been arrested by the police and released because no charges were laid. Five days later a group of persons kidnapped them and threw them into the water with their hands and feet bound. They were also defence counsel for political prisoners.

9. As a result of these events, the lawyers who were working on political trials and who were still at large, began to refuse systematically this sort of case, alleging that they were given no protection. Political prisoners began to be defended by public defenders who only provided a totally ineffective pro forma defence.

Also several lawyers complained that when political prisoners instructed legal counsel of their own choosing, their conditions of detention became more rigorous.
10. Dr. Antonio Benitez, Minister of Justice, told me that he himself had been imprisoned in the past for nearly two years without any trial whatsoever and without any international organisation concerning itself with the matter. The same thing happened with the Minister of the Interior, Dr. Alberto Rocamora.

He stated that the lawyers who defended political prisoners were also militant activists in politics and it was because of their militancy that some had been killed and others arrested. As regards the latter group, he stated that the situation of each detainee was being examined and that on the basis of the conclusions reached they would either be released or sent for trial.

The Minister stated also that the lawyers were getting fabulous sums from the guerrilla organisations. The police had found the books of the ERP (The People's Revolutionary Army) showing that a payment of 600 million (old) pesos had been paid to lawyers. (37)

Dr. Benitez declared also that judges were being intimidated by subversive organisations and often resorted to claiming lack of jurisdiction over the matter as a delaying tactic in order to avoid having to hand down a decision. (38) The Minister stated that the Government has no knowledge of activities of para-police groups and that it is ignorant of the identity of those responsible for the attorneys' deaths.

It is a fact that many lawyers are political activists. Dr. Deleroni belonged to the "Peronismo de Base" organisation. (39) Dr. Ortega Peña also belonged to the "Peronismo de Base" organisation and was a member of the Government block. (40) In the note issued by Drs. Silvio Frondizi and Manuel Gaggero, entitled "Press Conference", in the name of the defence counsel of the detainees in Catamarca, it was stated that they, along with Drs. Julio Marcolli, Jorge Marca, Alfredo Curutchet, Felipe Martin and Rafael Perez, formed that National Central Committee of the Lawyers of FAS, the "Anti-imperialist Front for Socialism".

It did not appear, however, that any of these lawyers had engaged in illegal political activities nor that they were connected with subversive organisations. The homage paid to Dr. Ortega Peña in the Chamber of Representatives and the (useless) guarantees of personal safety given to Dr. Silvio Frondizi ten days before his death by the Minister of Justice, bear witness to this.

11. The Buenos Aires Bar Association (College of Advocates) has never spoken out in defence of lawyers or in favour of defending political prisoners. In Buenos Aires (contrary to the practice elsewhere in the country) lawyers are not obliged to be registered members of the Bar Association. It is said that the Buenos Aires Bar Association (College of Advocates) is extremely conservative, opposing compulsory membership and formed of a small number of practitioners.

The Buenos Aires Association of Advocates is numerically much more important than the Bar Association. It is in favour of compulsory membership of the Bar Association and is a moderate body.

The Guild of Advocates, founded in 1971 and today practically non-existent, was noted for its defence of political prisoners (guerrilla
fighters included), its denunciations of monopolies, and its struggle for popular demands, as well as for its counselling of trade unions and workers. It consisted of leftist lawyers, both "Peronista" and otherwise. All of the lawyers killed were members of the Guild. It has twice been hit by terrorist attacks. Its leaders have disappeared, are under arrest or are in exile.

Part II

The State of Siege

12. At present there is in force over the whole of the national territory a state of siege decreed by the Executive on November 6, 1974, during the congressional recess.

The Constitution of the Republic of Argentina empowers the President of the Republic (Article 86, clause 19) to declare a state of siege in cases of "internal upheaval" if the Congress is in recess. Congress normally sits from May 1 to September 30 (Article 55 of the Constitution).

The state of siege suspends all constitutional guarantees, confers on the President of the Republic the power to order arrests and transfers of persons from one place to another within the national territory, unless they prefer to leave the country (Article 23 of the Constitution). Under the Argentinian system, a state of siege effectively permits the arrest and detention of any person for an indefinite period of time.

The state of siege was decreed after a series of serious attacks which were carried out by the guerrilla groups, the most significant of which are the "Montoneros" and the ERP (People's Revolutionary Army).

The Subversive Organisations:

13. The Montoneros group, formed in hiding in 1969, is composed of young persons with middle class, catholic and nationalist backgrounds. From its inception it has always been avowedly Peronist, signing its communications with the motto "Peron o Muerte" ("Peron or Death"). The movement took shape on the national level with the kidnapping and death of General Pedro E. Aramburu, former President of Argentina. (41)

During the 1970 - 1973 period, the organisation undertook innumerable assaults and attacks (by the placing of explosives), and receiving growing support from the Peronist Youth Movement and from General Peron himself who, on diverse occasions, referred to it as "that marvellous youth who struggles against military dictatorship with weapons in their hands and who know how to give their lives for the Fatherland". (42)

After having begun on this catholic and populist ideological foundation, the Montoneros gradually became more and more socialist. Its documents point to an evolution towards Marxism, although it is faltering and ill-defined. In its ideology and in its connection to the Peronist movement, it is
fundamentally distinct from the People's Revolutionary Army (ERP) and all of the other leftist groups or parties. It hopes to take power by guerrilla actions, organising the working class so that, after the spread of the armed conflict, it can take power. In the present political situation its aim is the overthrow of the present government which is does not recognise as Peronist. It condemns the Peronist trade union and political leadership as "a turn-coat bureaucracy".

The main tactics of the Montoneros are violent (and in this it is not alone). Its armed manoeuvres consist of: (a) kidnapping officials or owners of large undertakings in order to raise funds; (b) kidnapping officials or owners of large companies which are in conflict with its own officers, so as to force the undertakings to yield to the demands of the workers; (c) executions by attacks on policemen accused of having tortured or killed political activists. Similarly, it has eliminated various right-wing Peronist militants, accusing them of the deaths of some of its own activists. This came about in connection with the participants in the Ezeiza massacre.

The hostilities between the government (or rather the official-line Peronists) and the Montoneros became more serious after Peron's death (on July 1, 1974). The periodicals Descamisado, Causa Peronista and El Peronista were closed down. The same happened to the newspaper Noticias which was of the same tendency. On September 6, 1974, the Montoneros stated that they were going underground to take up the armed struggle again "because all possibilities of legal action have been exhausted". The movement has declared war on the government. Since then it has been credited with a large number of acts of violence, such as the murder of trade union leaders, the execution of Inspector Viliar, chief of the federal police, the kidnapping and murder of the United States Consul in Córdoba, the kidnapping of the Born brothers (of the powerful Bunge and Born concern), etc.

14. The People's Revolutionary Army (ERP) also came to the fore during the military dictatorship as the armed wing of the Workers' Revolutionary Party (PRT) at its fifth congress in 1970-71. It had its baptism of fire in the operations carried out in Córdoba in June 1971. It is of Trotskyite persuasion and considers itself the only truly revolutionary movement. It distinguished itself in certain operations which had wide repercussions and which it carried off with remarkable efficiency. Thus, for example: there was the attack on the military garrison at Azul in February 1974. A military installation (located some 230 miles from Buenos Aires) was occupied, arms were taken and the second-in-command was kidnapped and afterwards killed. About the middle of that year they attacked a military factory in Villa Maria, a town near Córdoba, and took a great quantity of arms. A further spectacular operation in Catamarca was frustrated by chance circumstances.

Among the kidnappings of important businessmen, the ERP claims credit for that of the General Manager of Exxon (Argentina), released outside the country on payment of the fabulous sum of US$14,000,000. (46)

At the present time, the army is carrying out a wide-ranging military operation in the mountainous region of Tucumán, where it is alleged that the guerrilla fighters are installing their headquarters. (47)

15. There are other groups engaged in subversion. The kidnapping of the Chief Justice of the Supreme Court of Buenos Aires, Hugo Anzoarregui, was
carried out by the PAL, inspired by Che Guevara. It was claimed that through this kidnapping information was obtained concerning a guerrilla fighter in custody. The fighter in question was finally sent to Peru and the judge released. (48)

The political violence of the subversives was invoked as justification for the state of siege. In view of the impressive succession of murders and violent attacks which have taken place recently, the Minister of Labour, Ricardo Ortero, stated in Posadas "Argentina is now experiencing a time of war". (Jornal do Brasil, March 28, 1975)

The Activities of the Para-Police Groups

16. This presents the most serious phenomenon in the crisis which Argentina is undergoing. That there are para-police groups operating is not open to the slightest doubt. (49) The most important and most remarkable is that which operates under the name "AAA" (Argentine Anti-Communist Alliance), whose first operation was the attempt on the life of the Radical Senator Solari Irigoyen, in December 1973. (50) This organisation took responsibility for the majority of the kidnappings, attacks and crimes committed in recent months in reply to subversive terrorism.

There is no proof of there being a connection between the AAA and the police or the government. Nevertheless, certain significant facts can be mentioned to show, at least, official complacency towards it:

(a) The absolute impunity of the right-wing groups. Up to now, except in the Deleroni case (which was not undertaken by the AAA, but by an independent group whose executioner was captured by a combination of fortuitous events) none of the innumerable crimes which have been carried out by right-wing groups has ever been solved.

(b) The elements who form these groups declare themselves to be members of the federal police and act freely and openly using vehicles which are not stolen and which very often correspond to the types and makes used by the police. They are not disturbed by the public authorities in any way even if they are carrying out operations in full light of day and with no particular rush, as was the case in the kidnappings and deaths of Atlílio López and Silvio Frondizi, and the raid on the offices of the newspaper, Voz del Interior, amongst others.

(c) A defence of clandestine activities of the police made in an article published in the official organ of the Peronist Party, the review Las Bases, which is managed by a Minister, Mr. Lopez Rega. In this article the point of view is put forward that there is no reason to criticise the police if they resort to illegal and underground tactics to suppress illegal and underground groups.

The weekly El Caudillo, of an obviously totalitarian persuasion, openly propagandised for violent action against leftist militants, many of whom were subsequently killed by right-wing commandos (Ortega Peña, Father Mugica, Atlílio López, etc). It maintains the subversives must die so that the fatherland may live. In its editorials the phrase "the best enemy is a dead enemy" constantly appears. This periodical always carries a substantial amount of advertising for the Ministry of Social Welfare. (51)
(d) Lawyers who visited political prisoners received letters threatening them with death shortly after their visits. In the letter received by Dr. Horácio Ramiro Vivas, there was an error in one of his Christian names - the same which he had noted on the official authorisation for his visit and which he presented to the prison guards.

(e) In a document made public on November 4, 1974, the families of political prisoners denounced an episode which had taken place in the Villa Devoto prison the week before: the prisoners in a certain ward were moved out of their cells for a brief time so that these might be inspected. Upon their return, they found printed on the walls the letters "AAA".

17. The AAA organisation, by means of communiqués made to the mass media, publicly assumed responsibility for various crimes, amongst which are the murders of the former Chief of Police of Buenos Aires, Julio Troxler, of the Member of Congress Ortega Peña, of the lawyer Alfredo Curuchet, of the former Vice-Governor of Córdoba Atilio López and of Juan Varas, former Under-Secretary of Commerce of that province. (52) It has sent threatening letters to a great number of persons of the most differing walks of life and tendencies, among whom are Members of Congress and Senators (53), judges, university professors, clerics, trade union and student leaders and even actors (54). Such threats were also made against any and all lawyers who might defend or have defended political prisoners, as already mentioned.

18. Some impressive events and circumstances, only some out of many, merit special reference, besides the murders of lawyers already described in the first Part of this study.

On February 18, 1974, a heavy explosive blew up in one of the streets of central Buenos Aires. It was being carried by Alejandro Giovenco Romero in a brief-case. He lost his arm and subsequently died. It was discovered that he worked as a body-guard at the Metalworkers Union and belonged to the Peronist Youth. He was considered an expert in arms and explosives and took part in weekly meetings with the President of Argentina, at Olivos, as representative of the National Centre of Peronist Youth. (55) There is no indication that any investigation of the event has taken place. Similarly, there is no information on what was to be the bomb's distinction.

The kidnappings and attacks are countless in which Ford Falcon automobiles, similar to those used by the federal police, appear. The kidnapping of Dr. Silvio Frondizi has already been mentioned. In that case a car of this make was abandoned by the perpetrators of the crime, but nothing was ever heard of it. Ford Falcon cars carrying criminals on various other missions have been noted: at the kidnapping and death of the trade union leader Carlos Borromeo Chavez, which took place on June 17, 1974 (56); at the shooting of two young men in the Los Perales district of Mataderos (57); at the attack against the headquarters of the Peronist Youth, First Regional Office, on June 29, 1974 (58); at the shooting attack against a worker on August 2, 1974 (59); the kidnapping and death of Atilio López, former Vice-Governor of Córdoba, and of Juan José Varas (60); the kidnapping and death of Eduardo Ambrosio Romero, Villero Peronist Movement militant from Córdoba, on the occasion of President Peron's funeral (61); at the death of Enrique Rusconi, leader of the Revolutionary Communist Party, on December 7, 1974 (62); at the death of five alleged subversives at Villa Lugano, in Buenos Aires, on December 13, 1974 (63); at the kidnapping and death of Hector Jorge Cols and Maria del Carmen Baldo on December 12, 1974 (64).
The kidnappings and deaths of Atilio López and Juan José Varas, on September 16, 1974, are surprising. Both had been staying in a Buenos Aires hotel since the 11th. Varas had decided to return to Córdoba and was going towards the airport. His name was called over the loudspeakers, but he was already inside the aeroplane. His disembarkation was requested by the flight control tower and was authorised by persons claiming to belong to the Federal Coordination Authority. Then Varas was captured and taken back to the hotel where Atilio López was staying. There his capturers identified themselves once again as policemen, went up to López' apartment and brought him back under arrest and handcuffed along with Varas. They all got into an automobile and left at high speed. Hours later both corpses were found drilled with bullet-holes in an open space in greater Buenos Aires. There are other details: in front of the hotel one of the cars was double-parked and this came to the attention of a patrolman. He, after having spoken to the occupants of the vehicle, went on his way. Nothing is known of the investigation, which was supposed to verify this occurrence.

Atilio López was, along with the then Governor Obregon Cano, deposed in Córdoba on February 27, 1974, by the then Chief of Police, Colonel Antonio Domingo Navarro. Both had been elected and taken office on May 25, 1973. The President of the Republic gave his support to this illegal act and issued a decree authorising federal intervention in the province. (66) Navarro attempted to bring to trial some 80 persons who were on the Governor's staff charging them with illegal possession of weapons, but the trials were adjourned sine die. (67) Criminal charges were brought against Navarro but he was subsequently pardoned by the President of the Republic. (68)

Many people name Colonel Navarro as an AAA leader.

The attacks against political and activist organisations, trade unions and their leaders are countless. The kidnappings and murders, many of which were perpetrated with refined cruelty, are numerous, and all of them are fully documented. In 1974 alone more than 300 crimes were committed. (69)

Attacks on the Judiciary

19. It can be stated that virtually all federal judges and magistrates of the Supreme Court receive threats from the AAA if they act leniently towards persons convicted of subversion.

20. In Córdoba, Judge Carlos Haiberadián was the victim of a grievous assault because he had sentenced 13 policemen to prison terms on their conviction for the death of five officials of the Argentinian Cooperative Association (whom in the beginning they had tried to pass off as subversive). When, in February 1974, Colonel Navarro deposed the legally elected governor, the judge's residence was the target of a bombing attack and was partially destroyed.

On May 28, 1974, he was in his home, by then rebuilt, with two friends when, towards the end of the evening, he was called on the door phone (intercom system) by persons identifying themselves as from the"Governor's protocol staff". One of the two friends went down to open the door and was immediately threatened by two persons, carrying automatic weapons, supported by two other individuals who were in a car. Faced with such an imminent attack Dr. Haiberadián, having no other exit, jumped out of a window some 18 feet
above ground, onto the patio of a neighbouring house and suffered considerable bodily injury. His assailants, having looked for him throughout the house and saying that they had come to kill him, left uttering threats.

Some four months later, during which time neither the public authorities nor the police had made the slightest effort to undertake an inquiry, the person who had answered the door recognised one of the assailants in a public place. Upon carrying out a personal investigation, he discovered that the person was a public servant in the security service of the Ministry of Social Welfare, working on a short-time posting in Córdoba. He further found out that the attacker belonged to the "Black Eagle Squadron", a para-police group whose aim is to intimidate and liquidate political militants, which confirmed that it had sought to kill Judge Hailberadián because it thought him to be connected with leftist Peronist groups. (70)

21. Towards the end of 1974, there was a complete re-shuffle in the judiciary, and judges were given exceptionally favourable incentives to take early retirement. All of them took advantage of this and retired, leaving the field open for new judges.

Arrests

22. There is considerable doubt as to the number of persons presently held at the Executive's pleasure. The Minister of the Interior, Dr. Alberto Rocamora, recently declared that he did not know the exact number, but he estimated some 700. (71) Dr. Antonio Benitez, the Minister of Justice, told me that there were 600 persons under arrest. Antonio Tróccoli, Member of Congress and leader of the Radical Civic Union (UCR) in the House of Representatives, thinks that the number of prisoners must be in the range of 1,200. The Argentinian Human Rights League, in a document to which reference has already been made, reports that the number of prisoners is estimated at 2,000, but this would seem exaggerated.

Only a small number, certainly not more than 300, have been tried. The others are in the strange situation of prisoners for an indefinite time not charged with anything.

Mr. Tróccoli spoke out in favour of a Parliamentary Commission "to examine the grounds for each arrest so as to judge politically what use is being made of the emergency powers (state of siege). In this manner it would be shown that the great majority of arrests have been unfounded and that consequently those being punished in this manner should be released." (72) A Provincial Committee of the UCR in Córdoba made a public protest against indiscriminate arrests of persons who had nothing to do with subversion and against the forcible entry of homes by the police without warrant or basis. (73)

23. The situation of the detainees is not a good one. The National Constitution provides that "the Nation's prisons shall be healthy and clean, used for the security and not for punishment of the criminals housed in them, and any measures taken on the grounds of preventive action which leads to the inflicting of anything other than what is required by law, shall be brought before the sentencing judge" (last part of Article 18).
A Draft General Part of the Penal Code, recently drawn up by a Government appointed commission, notes, however, in its preamble that certain penal establishments contain "often-times sub-human conditions". (74) Serious uprisings have taken place in the prisons of San Nicolas (Buenos Aires Province) and at Olmos (Rosario). (75)

It is common practice to move political prisoners from one part of the country to another, including to penal institutions located at distant places such as Rio Gallegos prison, some 1,600 miles from the capital. Many documents drawn up by organisations of the families of political detainees complain of the appalling conditions in which the prisoners are kept in various prisons, Villa Devoto in the capital included. (76) The situation at Rawson, Chubut Province, in far distant Patagonia, is particularly disquieting. Political prisoners started being sent there on December 14, 1974, and according to rumour there are about 140 prisoners in Rawson.

Political prisoners come under a regulation issued on May 14, 1963, which provides that lawyers may see prisoners but have no physical contact with them and meetings must take place in visiting rooms "under direct and watchful supervision, undertaken for reasons of security" (s. 10).

Torture of Political Prisoners

24. Cases of proven torture of political prisoners are common. While I was in Buenos Aires, the papers published a statement of former President Arturo Frondizi to the effect that "it will not have escaped anyone's notice that torture is almost becoming an institution in our country. If on the one hand the terrible degradation of torture is not fought against, no attempt can be made at extirpating that other terrible degradation consisting of the death of innocent people in guerrilla warfare." (77)

There exist many reports of torture which have been written by political prisoners with minute and detailed descriptions of the sufferings to which they were subjected.

The torture inflicted by the police on Eusébio de Jesús Maestre and Luiza Galli de Platkovski, arrested on April 17, 1974, have been proved by an official medical expert report, as well as those inflicted on Alberto Miguel Campos and Rosa Maria Pargas, arrested on the 19th of that month. (78)

At the press conference held by the counsel for the defence of the prisoners in Catamarca on August 10, 1974, it was stated that all of the prisoners had been subjected to horrible torture including drugs. The prisoners were examined by a medical board formed of seven doctors appointed by the Catamarca Medical Association, which found that they had been the victims of torture including electric shocks and long privation of water and food.

The Chamber of Representatives of Tucumán, through a Commission of Enquiry, accused 54 high-ranking heads of the provincial police of ill-treatment of political detainees. The torture practiced on seven persons arrested in Tucumán on September 27, 1974 (Castro, Tumini, Geraud, De Benedetti, Ripodas and Meloni) (79) has been judicially proved.
Similarly, in Santa Fé the coroner proved that labour leader Ovidio Valentin Granetto and the young Oscar Herbetta had been subjected to torture. (80)

Freedom of the Press

25. From July 1973, the circulation of various periodicals and newspapers (El Mundo, Noticias, Respuesta Popular, La Calle and Crónica) and reviews (El Descamisado, Militancia, La Causa Peronista, De Frente, El Peronista, Cabildo) has been prohibited by Government decree.

Some of these periodicals were associated with the revolutionary side of Peronism, such as Militancia, El Descamisado and De Frente, journals directly bound up with the Peronist Youth Movement. Noticias and La Causa Peronista, closed down on August 27, 1974, and September 6, 1974, respectively, were unofficial organs of the Montoneros. The review Cabildo was anti-Peronist, notoriously pro-totalitarian and right-wing nationalist.

All of these periodicals were closed down by decision of the Executive without any attempt at recourse to judicial proceedings through which legal sanctions might ultimately have been imposed.

Various journals were the victims of bombings and machine-gun attacks (El Mundo, Voz del Interior, Noticias, Voz Serrana). The most serious occurrence to be recalled is the raid on the traditional Córdoban daily, Voz del Interior, whose offices were overrun by 50 men for two hours, without the slightest intervention on the part of the police. It is alleged that some time later a Minister of the Provincial Government, García Laval, handed the newspaper's manager a list of those participating in the crime.

There are records of diverse arrests and attempted kidnappings and murders of journalists. These events were fully described in the newspapers.

It is also alleged that the commercial press is fairly cautious in its criticism of the government. This is because it needs official advertising (which is the monopoly of the Telam Official Agency and is used as a means of pressure over the press) and furthermore it is necessary to assure itself of a license to import newsprint, since there is none produced nationally.

The Buenos Aires Lawyers' Association protested against the closure of periodicals by Executive intervention (81). The Argentinian Association of Journalists' Groups (ADEPA) at a recent meeting, called for the restoration of the freedom of the press "so severely compromised in Argentina in recent times". (82)
Penal Legislation

1. On the taking over of power by the new government on May 25, 1973, when Dr. Campora assumed the office of President, Act No. 20509 was immediately passed, revoking all penal laws which had not been duly enacted by the National Congress and reviving the provisions in force at the time of the issuance of the laws and legislative decrees which were thus repealed. Exceptions were made in respect of the amendments to the Penal Code introduced by Acts 17567 and 18934 in sections 173.7 (fraudulent management) and 11 (bargaining over aquired contractual rights); s. 179.2 (fraudulent bankruptcy); s. 190 (shipwrecks, running aground and airplane disasters); s. 194 (interruption of public transport and services); s. 198 (piracy at sea and on navigable rivers and high-jacking) and 175(bis) (usury). Exceptions were also made in respect of the abrogation of Acts Nos. 19359 and 20184 (exchange), 17250 (national provident funds) and 18247 (promotion and development of exports), which thus remain in force.

2. The government was authorised to set up a Penal Law Reform Commission and it submitted a General Part of the Penal Code, towards the end of last year.

3. It is alleged that not all of the repressive laws were repealed on May 26, 1973. There remained in force those establishing the CONASE (Security Council), the CONADE (Development Council), the CONES and the CONALYT, amongst others, thus empowering the Executive to intervene in the political economic and social life of every sector of the country in a totalitarian fashion. (1)

4. On January 28, 1974, an Act presented in Bill form by the Executive was passed introducing various amendments to the Penal Code relating to crimes against the person and activities connected with subversion (Act No. 20642).

This law was passed over the strong opposition of all of the left-wing elements. It increases - in some cases drastically - the penal consequences of certain crimes: kidnapping, extortion, incitement to crime, illicit association (which is now punishable by imprisonment of from 3 to 10 years, with a minimum sentence for leaders or organisers of 5 years), public intimidation, the organisation of or participation in an association which attacks public order (making membership in such an association punishable by imprisonment for a term of 3 to 8 years), sedition. The same Act creates new types of crime also: threats, extortion by kidnapping, the manufacture, possession or supplying of explosive, incendiary, asphyxiating or toxic substances or mechanisms for the purpose of disturbing public security, the falsification of motor vehicle ownership and driving permits. (2)

As a result of the increase in sentences several crimes can no longer give rise to bail applications. The latter have in any case been modified by Act No. 20516 of July 6, 1973.

The Radical Civic Union (UCR), main opposition party, was also totally opposed to the proposed Penal Code Amendments, claiming that such reforms...
were attempting to re-introduce many of the aspects of the repressive legislation which had been repealed on May 26, 1973. It also made the point that the measures were unnecessary "since the government already has all constitutional and legal powers for combating subversion and violence". (3)

5. On September 30, 1974, a Security Act was passed, punishing subversive activities of any kind.

This law (Act No. 20840) punishes with imprisonment of from 3 - 8 years whoever, for the purpose of bringing to fruition his ideological tenets, attempts or encourages by any means whatsoever the alteration or suppression of the established order and the social peace of the nation, in a manner not established in the National Constitution or legal provisions regulating the political, economic and social life of the nation (section 1).

Those who engage in the distribution, propagation or diffusion of materials tending to indoctrinate, or who seek to convert or instruct on matters relating to any conduct prohibited under section 1, can be punished by prison terms ranging from 2 to 6 years; anyone publicly defending such crimes, their perpetrators or collaborators; anyone having the authority to exhibit, print, publish, reproduce, distribute or supply by whatever means, printed or engraved material, through which facts, communications or pictures of conduct prohibited by section 1 are made public; anyone having under his control or authority telecommunications equipment for transmitting without lawful authorisation and anyone using such equipment or abetting anyone else in the use of the same without lawful excuse, are all similarly punishable.

This Act also punishes the use or possession of emblems, insignia or badges standing for notoriously subversive organisations with from 2 - 5 years imprisonment and the same penalty is provided for editors and publishers of any kind of publication, radio or television managers and broadcasters or those responsible for any means of communication which propagates information or facts, pictures or any sort of communication concerning the conduct described in section 1. (4)

A penalty of from 1 to 3 years imprisonment is also provided for instigating the breach of obligations imposed by an award declaring a strike illegal. Industrial sabotage is also punishable when it is undertaken with guilty intent.

The crimes covered by this Act are under federal jurisdiction and bail procedures and suspended sentences are not applicable.

6. The Buenos Aires Lawyers' Association protested against the Security Act, stating that it made the holding of opinions a crime with the widest and most indiscriminate parameters, covering all types and means of creative and communicated thought, thus restricting constitutional guarantees. The Association further declared in its protest that the extent of penalties including additional sanctions such as the compulsory deportation of a foreign national and the withdrawal of his papers, amounts to a system of rigorous and indiscriminate repression which can in no way contribute to a process of national pacification and the elimination of terrorism. Moreover, the repression provided for in cases where labour conflicts were declared illegal was alleged to be in violation of guarantees laid down in the Constitution.

S-3178 (a)
FOOTNOTES

(1) Arrested on November 1, 1974. President of the Mar del Plata Section of the Argentine League for Human Rights and Vice-Chairman of the National Executive Council of this body. Member of the Intransigente Party.

(2) Arrested in Córdoba and handed over to the Federal Coordination Force.

(3) Former adviser to the Ministry of the Provincial Government of Santa Cruz. Arrested on November 12, 1974. Member of the Integrationist Development Movement.

(4) Arrested on November 19, 1974. Member of the (Peronist) Partido Justicialista.

(5) Former judge of the Supreme Court of Salta. Arrested in his office on November 28, 1974, the date on which federal intervention in the Province became effective. Now in prison at Villa Devoto, Buenos Aires.

(6) Detained in Catamarca.

(7) Solicitor for the Popular Leftist Front of Córdoba.

(8) Arrested in Mendoza on March 5, 1975.

(9) Arrested on November 1, 1974. President of the Tucumán Section of the Argentine League for Human Rights. Member of the Communist Party (which is legally recognised).

(10) Arrested in La Plata on November 13, 1974.

(11) Member of the Peronist Youth Movement, arrested in Bahia Blanca.

(12) Member of the (Peronist) Partido Justicialista, arrested in Bahia Blanca.

(13) Former Minister and former Secretary of the San Luis Peronist Congress.

(14) Under arrest since November 21, 1974, in Rosario.

(15) Member of the Socialist Workers Party.

(16) As to the arrest of Susana Aguad, Susana Buconic and Abraham Kozak at Córdoba on December 2, 1974, see La Voz del Interior (December 3, 1974). This paper also reports on the police's forcible entry of the law office of Ronald Troncoso. Susana Aguad, Susana Buconic and Abraham Kozak were counsel acting for workers and political detainees (La Voz del Interior, December 19, 1974). The "well-known Peronist militancy" of Miss Buconic was mentioned (La Voz del Interior, December 4, 1974).

(18) "To the Nation", March 22, 1975: "We are of the opinion that the detention of the colleagues named and the Decree instituting the State of Siege responsible for such detention, constitute a flagrant injustice to the manner in which they have always carried out their profession."

(19) La Nación, April 5, 1974.


(21) Noticias, August 6, 1974.

(22) La Nación, July 18, 1974, and Noticias, July 18, 1974, both with photographs.


(24) See the energetic protest made by the Buenos Aires Lawyers' Association on September 6, 1974, and published in its Bulletin.


(26) This lawyer was arrested during June 1974. He was Secretary-General of the Lawyers' Guild. Cf. El Cronista Comercial, June 7, 1974.


(30) Rodolfo Ortega Peña was engaged in extensive political activity. He had taken up office as a National Congressman about four months earlier, replacing a Member who had resigned because of disagreement over the Penal Code reforms. He was a member of FREJULI (Frente Justicialista de Liberación - The Just Liberation Front) of the Government block. He was a manager of the review Militancia, closed down by the Government in April 1974, cf. Noticias, June 21, 1974. There is a complete description of the crime in Noticias, August 2, 1974.

(31) Vide Noticias, August 3, 1974, with full photo coverage ("The Villar Funeral"); La Voz del Interior, August 3, 1974.


(33) Diario del Sesiones (i.e. the Congressional Record), August 1, 1974.

(34) Córdoba, September 13, 1974. This type of vehicle is used by the Federal Police and has been connected with innumerable violent acts, to which reference will be made below.
(35) See Córdoba, September 13, 1974, various statements. Curutchet had been imprisoned over some considerable period under the military dictatorships both in the prison of Villa Devoto and in Rawson in Patagonia. See the Petition published on September 12, 1974, by the Córdoba Fighting Trade Union Organisation.


(37) It would seem that this assertion is inconsistent with the alleged political militancy of the lawyers.

(38) Some judges interviewed on this matter stated that the legislation on procedure, as respects jurisdiction, is in chaos.

(39) The review Nuevo Hombre, first half of December 1973, records the political activity of this lawyer.

(40) He directed, along with Dr. Eduardo L. Duhalde, the review Militancia, closed down in April 1974. Cf. Cronica, June 19, 1974, and Noticias, August 21, 1974.

(41) The organisation justified the occurrence (taking place on March 29, 1970) by stating that Aramburu was responsible for the shooting of 27 Peronists, after the revolution on June 9, 1956.

(42) When he was elected President, General Perón confronted the Montoneros, calling them "stupid, smooth-chinned and mercenary youths". This took place at a meeting held on May 1, 1974, at the Plaza de Mayo.

(43) On June 20, 1973, as General Perón was returning to Argentina, a violent conflict between Peronist extremists took place in the woods surrounding Ezeiza airport, which resulted in dozens of deaths and woundings. Inexplicably, the police made no move to intervene and there has never been an official report on the matter. The event, of the greatest seriousness, seems to have been the signal for a wave of violence which has been going on ever since.

(44) The kidnapping was undertaken to force the government to bring into the open various militants who had simply disappeared. As there was no official response, the Consul was murdered and his body was found rolled in the flag of the Montoneros to which were glued the portraits of the militants who had disappeared.

(45) For the ERP, the Montoneros do not constitute a revolutionary movement but rather a petty-bourgeois one. Cf. Cuestionário, March 1975.

(46) Cuestionário, March 1975. Among the kidnappings of millionaires, that of the General Manager of FIAT should be mentioned. Common criminals have also begun to practise extortion by kidnapping. According to the Minister, Mr. Benitez, at present of every 10 kidnappings only 3 are political.

(47) Cuestionário, March 1975: "Que hay en Tucumán?" ("What is going on in Tucumán?")).
The events took place while I was in Buenos Aires. Upon his release, the judge sent a letter to the court over which he presided, stating that he had been kidnapped "for the sole purpose of forcing an explanation to be given of the whereabouts of Sergio Schneider, arrested by federal agents, and of whom there had been no news. This was made known to me while I was being held and I was properly treated." El Cronista Comercial, March 7, 1975; La Nación, March 7, 1975.

In an article published in the review Las Bases in 1972, General Perón himself stated "that para-police organisations, recruited and trained by persons in the military and in the police, are operating in Argentina". Cf. El Mundo, March 8, 1974.

Senator Irigoyen was seriously wounded by the explosion of a bomb placed in his car.

El Caudillo, March 5, 1975.

La Voz del Interior, September 22, 1974.

Member of Congress, Rodolfo Oscar Vittar and Roberto Vidaña (of Córdoba province), Armando Daniel Croato and Carlos Miguel Kunkel (of Buenos Aires) protested against the receipt of threatening letters signed by the AAA. The same happened to other parliamentarians, amongst them Members of Congress Jorge Omar Viale and Jesús Mira. Senator Solari Irigoyen, before the assault which he suffered, had also received a threatening letter. Member of Congress Hector Sandler was threatened for "being the counsel to the ERP mercenaries". Cf. La Voz del Interior, September 17, 1974.

Clarín, September 26, 1974; Cronica, September 26, 1974; La Opinión, September 27, 1974. In a press release the AAA stated that the artists Norman Briski, Nacha Guevara, Hector Alterio, Luiz Brandoni and Horácio Guarany were condemned to death because "high command had noted their anti-social activities in favour of Marxism in the artistic milieu".

See the newspapers of February 18, 1974, and Asi of February 22, 1974, with full reports on Giovenco, his activities and crimes.

El Cronista Comercial, June 18, 1974.


Noticias, August 6, 1974.

Asi, September 20, 1974.

Noticias, August 22, 1974.

La Voz del Interior, August 8, 1974.

La Voz del Interior, December 14, 1974.
(64) La Calle, December 14, 1974

(65) El Cronista Comercial, September 18, 1974; La Voz del Interior, September 20, 1974; Asi, September 20, 1974.


(69) See the document "El Regimen Democratico Peligra en la Argentina" (The Danger of the Democratic Regime in Argentina) published by the Argentine League for Human Rights on January 2, 1975. The chronology of events between the 1st and the 15th of December, here only excerpted, is impressive.

(70) See on this matter, El Mundo, February 6, 1974; El Cronista Comercial, February 19, 1974; La Voz del Interior, May 30, 1974, and Asi, June 7, 1974.

(71) La Nacion, March 7, 1975.

(72) La Calle, December 17, 1974.

(73) La Voz del Interior, December 12, 1974.

(74) Draft General Part of the Penal Code, Buenos Aires, 1974, p. 8. See the charges made by a prison chaplain in Noticias, August 6, 1974 ("The disgraceful conditions in prisons").


(76) See the publication Political Prisoners under the State of Siege: Arrest or Punishment? ("Presos Politicos por el Estado de Sitio: Arresto o cumplimiento de pena"), published by the Argentine League for Human Rights.

(77) La Razan, March 11, 1975.


(79) See also Noticias, August 25, 1974.

(80) De Frente, No. 7, p. 11 (June 20, 1974).

(81) Boletin, No. 325, November 1974.


***

S-3178 (a)
FOOTNOTES to APPENDIX

(1) "The Danger of the democratic Regime in Argentina", cit. supra.


(3) La Nación, January 11, 1974.

(4) The People's Revolutionary Army was declared illegal by Decree No. 1454 (1973), by the then President Raul Lastiri. The press may not publish the name ERP nor the name Montoneros. The former is always referred to as "the outlawed organisation" and the latter as "the organisation which went underground". Cf. Cuestionario, No. 23 (March 1975).