



General Assembly

Distr.: General
16 August 2013

Original: English

Sixty-eighth session

Item 67 (a) of the provisional agenda*

Elimination of racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance: elimination of racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance

Contemporary forms of racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance

Note by the Secretary-General

The Secretary-General has the honour to transmit to the General Assembly the report of the Special Rapporteur on contemporary forms of racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance, Mutuma Ruteere, on the implementation of Assembly resolution [67/154](#).

* [A/68/150](#).



Report of the Special Rapporteur on contemporary forms of racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance

Summary

The present report to the General Assembly is submitted pursuant to Assembly resolution [67/154](#) on “glorification of Nazism: inadmissibility of certain practices that contribute to fuelling contemporary forms of racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance”, in which the Special Rapporteur on contemporary forms of racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance was requested to prepare a report on the implementation of the resolution, based on views collected from Governments and non-governmental organizations.

Following a brief introduction to the content of resolution [67/154](#), the Special Rapporteur summarizes the contributions sent by 16 States on the implementation of the resolution, as well as views sent by seven intergovernmental, non-governmental and other organizations pertaining to the issue raised in the resolution. The Special Rapporteur then puts forward a number of conclusions and recommendations.

Contents

	<i>Page</i>
I. Introduction	4
II. Contributions received from Member States	5
A. Argentina	5
B. Azerbaijan	5
C. Belarus	6
D. Burkina Faso	6
E. Cameroon	8
F. Cyprus	9
G. Ecuador	9
H. Iraq	11
I. Nicaragua	11
J. Russian Federation	12
K. Saudi Arabia	13
L. Serbia	13
M. Singapore	15
N. Spain	16
O. Thailand	17
P. Ukraine	17
III. Contributions received from intergovernmental, non-governmental and other organizations ..	18
A. European Union	18
B. Council of Europe	19
C. International Association of Jewish Lawyers and Jurists	19
D. German Institute for Human Rights	19
E. Latvian Human Rights Committee	20
F. Social Action Centre/No Borders project	20
G. Other submissions	20
IV. Conclusions and recommendations	21

I. Introduction

1. The present report is submitted pursuant to General Assembly resolution [67/154](#) on “glorification of Nazism: inadmissibility of certain practices that contribute to fuelling contemporary forms of racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance”.

2. Alarmed at the spread in many parts of the world of various extremist political parties, movements and groups, including neo-Nazis and skinhead groups and similar extremist ideological movements, which has led to an increasing number of acts of racially based violence and mounting hate speech in the public sphere, as observed by the Special Rapporteur on contemporary forms of racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance (see [A/HRC/23/24](#) and [A/67/328](#)), the General Assembly recalled, in paragraph 31 of resolution [67/154](#), the request of the Commission on Human Rights, in its resolution 2005/5, that the Special Rapporteur continue to reflect on this issue, make relevant recommendations in his future reports and seek and take into account in this regard the views of Governments and non-governmental organizations. In paragraph 9 of resolution [67/154](#), the Assembly stressed that failure by States to effectively address such practices was incompatible with the obligations of States Members of the United Nations under its Charter and with the purposes and principles of the Organization.

3. In paragraph 32 of resolution [67/154](#), the General Assembly requested the Special Rapporteur to prepare and submit to it at its sixty-eighth session a report on the implementation of the present resolution, based on the views collected, in accordance with the request of the Commission on Human Rights.

4. In accordance with the practice established in previous reports, the Special Rapporteur summarizes herein information received on relevant activities undertaken by Member States pursuant to resolution [67/154](#). In preparing the report, the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR) sent a note verbale on 18 April 2013 to Member States and a letter to non-governmental organizations requesting information on the implementation of the resolution. Replies were received from Argentina, Azerbaijan, Belarus, Burkina Faso, Cameroon, Cyprus, Ecuador, Iraq, Nicaragua, the Russian Federation, Saudi Arabia, Serbia, Singapore, Spain, Thailand and Ukraine. The Special Rapporteur also received contributions from the International Association of Jewish Lawyers and Jurists, Social Action Centre/No Borders project and the Latvian Human Rights Committee. Submissions were also received from the German Institute for Human Rights, the Council of Europe and the European Union. The Special Rapporteur wishes to thank all those who kindly contributed to the present report.

5. The information received is summarized herein, with particular attention paid to information relating to the provisions of paragraphs 4, 5, 7 to 9, 16 and 17 of resolution [67/154](#), as requested in paragraph 32 of the resolution. The original submissions are available for consultation at the secretariat of OHCHR.

II. Contributions received from Member States

A. Argentina

6. The Government refers to its Act on Discriminatory Acts (No. 23,592) of 1988, which lays the basis for combating all forms of discrimination in the country. The National Institute to Combat Discrimination, Xenophobia and Racism is specifically aimed at efforts to combat discrimination and is in charge of implementing proposals laid out in the national plan against discrimination, adopted in Decree No. 1086/2005, in line with the commitments that Argentina assumed at the World Conference against Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and Related Intolerance, held in Durban in 2001.

7. The Platform for an Internet free of discrimination attached to the Coordination Office of Observatories against Discrimination of the Institute aims to eradicate discriminatory expressions and hate speech on the Internet by detecting infringements of the Act on Discriminatory Acts. Since the beginning of 2013, 70 virtual sites containing anti-Semitic content have been closed down. The Department of Assistance to Victims of the Institute registers complaints of discrimination, including Internet content.

8. Several recent publications supported by the Institute tackle racism issues and anti-Semitism in particular. Two books, *Racismo: Hacia una Argentina intercultural* (Racism: towards an intercultural Argentina) and *Y le contarás a tus hijos ... Testimonios de los/as sobrevivientes de la Shoá en Argentina* (You will tell it to your children ... testimonies of Holocaust survivors in Argentina), discuss the Holocaust and the institutionalization of racism. A report on anti-Semitism was also released in Argentina at the end of 2012. Since 2010, the Government has officially recognized the International Day of Commemoration in memory of the victims of the Holocaust.

9. In December 2011, the Institute launched the Centre for Research, Development and Training on Cultural, Religious and Ethnic Diversity, known as DIVERSIA. Since its creation, DIVERSIA has held various training sessions and representatives have attended interschool meetings in order to promote cultural diversity.

10. The Institute has facilitated the signing by the Argentine Football Association of a framework agreement of cooperation against discrimination, xenophobia and racism, in which the parties agreed to work together against discrimination by undertaking joint actions, conducting campaigns and spreading appropriate values and good practices.

B. Azerbaijan

11. The Government drew attention to article 25 of its Constitution, which ensures equal rights and freedoms for everyone. An independent ombudsman protects the right to equality of all people, as guaranteed by article 25, by helping to redress violations of human rights and freedoms committed by government officials and by conducting awareness-raising activities.

12. The Human Rights Commissioner promotes the human rights and freedoms guaranteed in national legislation and international agreements, such as the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, to which Azerbaijan is a State party. The Human Rights Commissioner has made proposals for the ratifications of the Convention against Discrimination in Education and the Council of Europe Protocol No. 12 to the Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms (signed on 12 November 2003, but not yet ratified). In addition, the Commissioner carries out awareness-raising activities, such as those identified in the national plan of action established by a presidential decree of 27 December 2011. Some of the activities identified in the national plan of action are public hearings regarding the importance of non-discrimination, which are held for a broad range of stakeholders, such as government officials, local non-governmental organizations, the media, refugees and internally displaced persons.

C. Belarus

13. The Government referenced several articles of the civil, criminal, criminal procedure, administrative offences and electoral codes as containing provisions relevant to tackling racism. It also mentioned a number of laws, including acts on languages, national minorities, freedom of conscience and religious organizations, the legal status of foreign nationals and stateless persons in Belarus, voluntary associations, political parties, public events, the implementation procedure for citizens' right to initiate legislation, preventing money-laundering and the financing of terrorist activities, counter-terrorism, anti-corruption, anti-extremism and organized crime. In addition, it mentioned three presidential decrees: Nos. 300 of 1 July 2005, 302 of 1 July 2005 and No. 575 of 9 November 2010.

14. To strengthen inter-ethnic and interfaith tolerance, the Office of the Commissioner for Religious and Ethnic Affairs developed and began implementing in 2011 a programme to enhance the religious sphere and promote inter-ethnic relations and cooperation with compatriots abroad.

15. Belarus is a party to the Tripartite Forum on Interfaith Cooperation for Peace and Development, the Conference on Interfaith Dialogue and Cooperation for Peace and a member of the Group of Friends of the Alliance of Civilizations.

D. Burkina Faso

16. Burkina Faso is faced with neo-Nazi and neo-fascist acts as described by the resolution. It has, however, put in place legislative and other measures designed to combat all forms of discrimination.

17. Article 1 of the Constitution provides that discrimination of all sorts, especially based on race, ethnicity, region, colour, sex, language, religion, caste, political opinions, fortune and birth is prohibited.

18. Political leaders and parties are prohibited from inciting racial discrimination, xenophobia and violence. Article 13 of the Constitution proscribes the formation of political parties based on tribalism, regionalism, racism or sectarianism. Furthermore, article 4 of the charter for political parties and groups provides that

political parties and groups must proscribe all forms of intolerance, regionalism, ethnocentrism, fanaticism, racism, xenophobia and incitation to violence in their programmes and activities.

19. Article 47 of Act No. 10/92/ADP on freedom of association provides that, once it is established that an association has an illicit purpose or goal, especially the justification or practice of racial discrimination and xenophobia, it can be dissolved. The leaders of such organizations can be subjected to judicial prosecution in accordance with article 132 of the penal code, which punishes all discriminatory acts and activities. The sanctions include a prison sentence ranging from one to five years and an interdiction to reside on the national territory for five years.

20. Article 112 (2) of the information code condemns defamation against groups of people based on race, region and religion with the goal of inciting hatred among citizens, with sentences of imprisonment ranging from one month to one year and fines ranging from 100,000 to 1 million CFA francs.

21. The ministries of justice, human rights, promotion of women and social action participate in the prevention of, and protection against, all forms and manifestations of racism. Courts and tribunals are mandated to receive complaints relating to cases of racism and xenophobia.

22. Other institutions also play a role, including the National Human Rights Commission, the Commission on Technologies and Freedoms and the High Council for Communication. The High Council is, among other things, mandated to suspend and shut down communication channels promoting racism and xenophobia or spreading extremist ideologies.

23. The primary, post-primary and secondary school curricula incorporate modules on the Second World War, Nazism and fascism in order to raise awareness among young people of atrocities resulting from extremist ideologies and to instil values of peace, tolerance and solidarity in society. The national television also broadcasts programmes on the two world wars, Nazism and fascism in order to inform and raise the awareness of the public.

24. The national strategic plan of 2008 to promote peace and tolerance and the three-year plan of action of 2010 for the promotion of a culture of peace and tolerance aim to foster values of tolerance and peace in all sectors of society.

25. A study conducted in 2011, with the support of OHCHR, showed that at the national level many forms of racial discrimination continued to exist. As a result of the study the national plan of action to combat racial discrimination, xenophobia and all related intolerance was established, to be implemented between 2012 and 2016. The plan of action is a tool to combat racism by raising awareness. To promote the culture of peace and tolerance, a department for the promotion of peace and tolerance was created within the Ministry for Human Rights and Civil Promotion.

26. To facilitate the integration of foreigners and to promote cohesion, the National Commission for Integration, attached to the Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Regional Cooperation, organizes each year community days, which allow foreigners living in Burkina Faso to share their culture with local communities.

27. The national television also contributes to integration through programmes focusing on the foreign communities living in Burkina Faso and the culture of the various national ethnic groups.

28. The national plan of action includes workshops with civil society organizations and the production of leaflets.

E. Cameroon

29. Cameroon has been a State party to the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination since 24 June 1973. Its Constitution, in its preambular paragraphs, proclaims that the human person, without distinction as to race, religion, sex or belief, possesses inalienable and sacred rights.

30. Article 7 of Act No. 98/04 stipulates that the State guarantees to every person equality of opportunity with regard to access to education, without distinction as to gender, political, philosophical and religious opinion, social, cultural, linguistic or geographical origin. Similarly, article 6 (2) of Act No. 005 emphasizes that higher education contributes to the rule of law through the diffusion of a culture of respect for justice, human rights and participation in the eradication of all forms of discrimination and encourages the promotion of peace and dialogue.

31. The national programme for human rights education is implemented in primary and secondary school curricula to raise the awareness of the population as to their rights and respect for the rights of others, while ensuring the promotion of values of equality and non-discrimination. It is complemented by awareness-raising campaigns on human rights, mainly conducted through the media.

32. In accordance with article 4 of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, discriminatory practices are criminalized. Article 241 of the penal code, on contempt for races and religions, provides that anyone guilty of contempt, as defined in article 152 of the code, against a race or a religion to which a number of citizens and residents belong, is to be punished by a term of imprisonment ranging from six days to six months and a fine ranging from 5,000 to 500,000 CFA francs; if the infraction is committed through the press or radio, the maximum fine is 20 million CFA francs. Those penalties are doubled when the infraction is committed with the aim of triggering hatred or disdain between citizens.

33. Article 242 of the code, on discrimination, provides for a prison term ranging from one month to two years and a fine ranging from 5,000 to 500,000 CFA francs for anyone who denies access to open or public places or employment based on a person's race or religion.

34. Professional segregation is punished as a civil offence. The civil code recognizes that layoffs based on discrimination are unfair. Discrimination in social security benefits and employment is prohibited by law in article 180 of Ordinance No. 73/15 and articles 4 and 168 of the labour code.

35. Moreover, in conformity with Act No. 2012/001, all documents produced for electoral campaigns are submitted before publication for scrutiny by the national electoral management institution. Any documents calling for violence or inciting

hatred against a public authority, a citizen or a group of citizens will not be approved.

36. Article 151 of the electoral code requires political parties wishing to present candidates to legislative elections to reflect on their list of candidates the social diversity of the circumscriptions for which they are running.

37. No disaggregated data on grounds such as ethnicity or race are indicated on civil acts, national identity cards or other official documents. Neither ethnicity nor race are variables taken into account during the census.

F. Cyprus

38. One of the most significant tools for effectively combating all forms of racism is education. The educational system is available to all, irrespective of social or ethnic background or citizenship. The Ministry of Education offers accelerated courses in Greek during and after school hours for non-native speakers.

39. The Government provided several examples of educational reforms aimed at eradicating all forms of discrimination. One such programme is the “zones of educational priority” administered by the Ministry of Education and Culture. Such status is given to areas experiencing unusually high illiteracy rates, dropouts and violence in schools. The Ministry provides additional resources to the vulnerable groups within those schools.

40. The Observatory for Violence in Schools records and examines incidents of violence and focuses on racially motivated and xenophobic incidents. In 2009 and 2010, a programme financed by the European Commission was implemented, with the goal of eliminating discrimination and promoting the principle of equal treatment. Several programmes, such as the various lifelong learning programmes, the Council of Europe programmes and programmes developed by the Youth Board of Cyprus, specifically target young people in order to instil notions of cultural acceptance.

41. School curricula are focused on increasing respect for and understanding of other cultures. History classes specifically address the Second World War, the brutalities of Nazism in Greece and the Holocaust. *Compassito*, a manual on human rights education for children, is widely used in Cypriot schools as a tool to fight racism. In addition, physical education programmes and a project entitled “Sports for all” foster social inclusion and reduce incidents of delinquent behaviour.

42. Cyprus recognizes 27 January as the International Day of Commemoration in memory of the victims of the Holocaust and the date has been incorporated into the regulations for the operation of secondary schools since 2009.

G. Ecuador

43. Article 11.2 of the Constitution guarantees equality for all and provides that all discrimination will be punishable by law.

44. Chapter VII of the criminal code recognizes, defines and establishes penalties for offences relating to racial discrimination.

45. In accordance with the provisions of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, a three-year plurinational plan for the elimination of racial discrimination and ethnic and cultural exclusion — the anti-discrimination plan — was adopted in 2009. Its main objective is to eliminate the various forms and systematic practices of racial discrimination and cultural and ethnic exclusion and to promote a diverse, intercultural and inclusive citizenship through the public policies of the State at the national level.

46. The first focus area of the plan is justice and legislation, which is coordinated by the Ministry of Heritage in cooperation with the Ministry of Justice, Human Rights and Religion, the Office of the Ombudsman and the Ministry of National Defence. OHCHR provided support in implementing technical training. Four modules were developed on the collective rights of peoples and nations: one specifically for the armed forces, another for the national police, the third for justice officials and the fourth for the Office of the Ombudsman. A total of 47 authorities and officials of those institutions received training on collective rights in participatory workshops with national and international experts to enable them to take responsibility for replicating such training within their organizations. The armed forces and the national police will include the modules on collective rights in the curricula for their training courses. The modules were published in 2012, with a print run of 1,200 copies for each module.

47. These tools also contribute to raising awareness of the legal mechanisms that are in place for referring complaints of discrimination, xenophobia and any other form of exclusion or restriction, thus improving access to justice on an equal basis and promoting the right to information.

48. The Government reported that progress had been made in disseminating the international human rights instruments that it had ratified and signed, notably by publishing legal texts in ancestral languages, beginning with 1,000 copies in Shuar.

49. The anti-discrimination plan also focuses on education, communication and information. The Government considers the promotion of education based on cultural diversity to be the essential foundation for eradicating all forms of discrimination and violence.

50. The intercultural bilingual education system has been strengthened through the editing and publication of dictionaries, teaching materials and textbooks in ancestral languages: Sioni, Cofán, Waodani and Achuar.

51. There is also a programme to set up community radio networks in the territories of 13 nations — Achuar, Amazonian Kichwa, Huaorani, Andoa, Zápara, Shiwar, Shuar, Sioni, Secoya, Cofán, Tsáchila, Awá, Chachi and Epera — with a total of 14 community radio stations. The programme includes the training of new indigenous broadcasters to operate and present programmes in their territories.

52. The Coordinating Ministry for Heritage organized an international symposium of indigenous and Afro-descendant women writers in 2010 and 2011 and an international symposium of women poets of the Americas in 2012, in conjunction with the publication of anthologies of the poetry and stories of indigenous and Afro-Ecuadorian women.

53. In addition, in recognition of diversity, inclusion, social well-being, economic justice and the restoration and promotion of the cultural heritage of all regions of

Ecuador, the musical heritage programme *De taitas y de mamas, leyendas vivas de origen* (Of our fathers and mothers, ancient living legends) involves researching and compiling the musical heritage of the indigenous peoples, to be disseminated through mass media.

54. Lastly, an observatory of racial discrimination and ethnic exclusion was established and collaborates with academic institutions and indigenous and Afro-Ecuadorian organizations. It has produced three information bulletins on its work, covering the periods from January to March, April to June and July to December 2012, with a print run of 1,000 copies each.

H. Iraq

55. The Government noted the importance of efforts to combat extremist ideologies and hate speech. It also emphasized the importance of the legal framework in combating extremist groups and noted that States had an obligation to combat terrorism. The Government referred to the preambular paragraphs and articles 10, 14, 38 and 42 of the Constitution as guaranteeing fundamental freedoms and prohibiting discrimination.

I. Nicaragua

56. The Government noted that Nicaragua ratified the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination on 3 December 1977.

57. Article 5 of the Constitution acknowledges the multilingual, multicultural and multi-ethnic character of the country. The State recognizes the existence of indigenous peoples. The General Education Act (582) provides for the establishment of a regional autonomous education system. The Atlantic Coast Language Education Act, adopted by Decree No. 571, recognizes the right of peoples from the Atlantic coast, namely Miskitos, Sumos, Ramas and Creoles, to education in their mother tongue as a fundamental aspect of the existence and identity of individuals and peoples.

58. Article 4 of the Constitution stipulates that the State is to promote the human development of each and every Nicaraguan and protect them against any form of exploitation, discrimination or exclusion. Article 27 provides for equality before the law and prohibits discrimination on the grounds of birth, nationality, political views, race, sex, language, religion, opinion or economic or social status.

59. Article 427 of the penal code criminalizes any actions to hinder or obstruct a person in the exercise of a right or a choice provided for in the Constitution, laws, regulations or any other provisions on discriminatory grounds. Article 428 criminalizes the public promotion of any discriminatory acts referred to in the foregoing article. Article 315 criminalizes discrimination in employment on grounds of birth, nationality, political affiliation, race, ethnic origin, sexual orientation, gender, religion, opinion, economic status, disability, physical condition or any other type of social status.

60. The National Assembly adopted Act No. 757 (2 March 2011) on the fair and dignified treatment of indigenous and Afro-descendent peoples in order to regulate and ensure the equal and fair treatment of the indigenous Afro-descendent peoples

of the Caribbean coast, the Alto Wangki and the indigenous peoples of the Pacific, central and northern regions. This legislation provides that each and every non-governmental, private and public sector entity is subject to the provisions of the Constitution, international treaties and laws embodying the principle of non-discrimination in any and all of its forms.

61. To overcome the shortfall in the national statistics in capturing the cultural diversity of the country, a self-identification field was added to the eighth population and fourth housing census in 2005. Similar actions were taken to include ethnic variables in health and education statistics, primarily within the autonomous regions in bilingual intercultural schools, intercultural teacher training institutions, nurse training schools and intercultural community universities. Epidemiological variables, disaggregated by ethnicity, have been incorporated into the health system and steps are being taken to harmonize mainstream and traditional, ancestral medical practices.

62. As a means of combating prejudice, the Government promotes the inclusion of intercultural content at all levels of the educational system. The National Council of Universities has assumed the task of promoting multiculturalism in higher education, a process that entails including ethnic variables in university statistics, in addition to pedagogical and epistemological considerations.

63. To strengthen multiculturalism, the National Assembly has been devising policies to promote cultural interactions based on the principle of collective well-being as a means of building a nation of equals founded on cultural diversity, as opposed to racism and discrimination.

J. Russian Federation

64. Article 19 of the Constitution guarantees equality for all before the law. Article 26 (2) provides for the right to use one's own language to communicate and in education.

65. The Constitution prohibits the creation of organizations whose primary goal is to incite social and national hatred and division in society. Article 29 further prohibits propaganda and incitement to hatred as well as supremacist discourse.

66. Propaganda of ideas of supremacy on the basis of national and social origins is prohibited by law. Article 15 of the federal criminal code provides for criminal, administrative and civil penalties. Discriminatory motives are considered to be aggravating circumstances. Acts on the basis of political or ideological enmity or hate towards a social group have also been recognized as aggravating circumstances.

67. Groups involved in extremist activities leading to harm or constituting a real threat to citizens, public order, vulnerable groups and the environment can be dissolved following a court decision. The Federal Office of General Prosecution monitors the publication and dissemination of extremist materials. A list of such materials is made publicly available on the website of the Office.

68. Several ministries are involved in combating and preventing rising extremism and hate speech, including those of mass media and communications, internal

affairs, education and science and culture, which have each developed specific programmes and plans of actions to tackle extremism.

69. The Russian Federation news agency set up an internet portal, “Russia for everybody”, on which content is posted in the various languages of the national diasporas present in the country.

70. The Ministry of Internal Affairs permanently monitors websites to identify material posted by radical extremist groups promoting hatred and violence.

K. Saudi Arabia

71. Sharia law, from which Saudi Arabia derives all its legislation, prohibits all forms of discrimination, including racial discrimination. Article 39 of the Basic Law of Governance prohibits violations of human rights and incitement to disorder or discord and requires the media to educate the nation and consolidate its unity. The establishment of groups based on racial discrimination is prohibited.

72. After acceding to the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination in 1997, Saudi Arabia amended certain laws so as to prescribe severe penalties for denigrating the dignity of others. The Press and Publications Act, as amended by a royal decree in July 2001, criminalizes any disparagement of reputation or dignity, denigration or vilification of any person, incitement to bigotry and propagation of discord among citizens. The amendment to the Repression of Cybercrime Act, promulgated under the terms of a decision of the Council of Ministers in March 2007, prohibits defamation or harming of others through various information technology systems.

73. Saudi Arabia has acceded to the International Labour Organization Convention concerning Equal Remuneration for Men and Women Workers for Work of Equal Value (Convention No. 100) and the International Labour Organization Convention concerning Discrimination in Respect of Employment and Occupation (Convention No. 111).

74. Saudi Arabia has applied the international norms for the elimination of racial discrimination and xenophobia found in the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action and in the outcome document of the Durban Review Conference.

75. Tolerance is promoted by the Human Rights Commission through the educational system and mass media in accordance with the framework of the programme for the promotion of a human rights culture.

76. A directive issued in 2011 by the Ministry of Islamic Affairs, Endowments, Da'wah and Guidance prohibits imams or preachers from attacking persons or religious communities in their sermons. As a result, the Ministry has dismissed imams and preachers whose sermons contained incitement to hatred or any form of discrimination.

L. Serbia

77. The Government referenced an act banning manifestations by neo-Nazi or fascist organizations and associations and the display of neo-Nazi or fascist symbols and paraphernalia. The legislation prohibits all public discourse, acts, propaganda

material, symbols or marks instigating, encouraging or spreading hatred towards any people, national minority, church or religious community. It also bans propagation or justification of ideas and actions of people who have been convicted of war crimes. Furthermore, it imposes fines for individuals participating in manifestations or associations responsible for spreading or encouraging hatred and intolerance.

78. The Public Information Act prohibits the publishing of information that encourages discrimination, hatred or violence against persons or groups of persons on the basis of their race, religion, nationality, ethnicity, gender or sexual orientation. It further allows lawsuits to be filed by both victims and human rights organizations.

79. The broadcasting agency has the competence to prevent the broadcasting of programmes that instigate discrimination, hatred or violence. The Additional Protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime, concerning the criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems, prohibits the use of computer systems to endorse ideas or theories that support, encourage or promote hatred and discrimination.

80. The criminal code punishes actions, such as injury to reputation due to racial, religious, ethnic or other affiliation (art. 174), instigating national, racial and religious hatred and intolerance (art. 317) and racial and other discrimination (art. 387). It also recognizes racial motivation as an aggravating circumstance.

81. The recently adopted article 344 (a) of the criminal code criminalizes violent behaviour at sporting events, including incitement to national, racial and religious hatred or intolerance during sporting events through behaviour or slogans leading to violence or physical confrontation with the participants of the sporting event.

82. The Associations Act provides that the goals and operation of an association must not, among other things, be directed towards the incitement or encouragement of inequality, hatred and intolerance. The Political Parties Act stipulates that the operations of political parties must not be directed towards, among other things, the violation of constitutionally guaranteed human and minority rights or incitement and encouragement of racial, national or religious hatred. This is also stipulated in the Anti-Discrimination Act.

83. There have been increasing online activities of nationalistic organizations. The special High-Tech Crime Prosecution Office, established as part of the Higher Prosecution Office, has registered more than 1,700 cases, with a clear indication that there is an annual increase in the number of cases received.

84. Similarly, increasing manifestations of racism and xenophobia have been noted, in particular against the Roma and members of other national minorities, including racist statements towards Roma pupils and students. The Government provided detailed statistical data from the Ministry of Justice and Public Administration documenting the number of received, resolved and pending criminal cases.

85. The Ministry of Internal Affairs adopted a regulation on training, leading to the annual adoption and implementation of vocational training programmes for police officers. The training focuses on topics such as policing relating to minority groups, respecting differences and overcoming prejudices.

86. Since 2012, the Ministry of the Interior has implemented a series of affirmative actions to increase the representation of members of national minorities in police departments responsible for areas with a mixed ethnic population. For the development of police communications with representatives of Roma and other minority communities, round tables have been held on the safety and protection of Roma and other vulnerable groups and communities.

87. The Government referenced the Education Strategy 2020 and the Primary Education Act, which provides for conditions of unsegregated inclusion of all children in the education system and vocational training, which has facilitated the enrolment of children from minority groups in classes where the teacher can communicate in their language.

88. Serbia is involved in a teacher training programme for Holocaust education. Human rights education is incorporated into the curriculum among other civic education courses taught in primary and secondary schools as a required subject. The Government provided detailed examples of projects and programmes relating to efforts to combat racism and discrimination, for students, educators, communities and governmental institutions.

89. Reports from independent bodies indicate that there are, however, still cases of discrimination in various areas of the country. The Commissioner for the Protection of Equality has warned of repeated incidents affecting Roma communities.

90. The Commissioner initiated a research programme to assess the understanding of the general population regarding hate speech and their definition of it, to help to design informed policies to combat racism, xenophobia and extremist groups.

M. Singapore

91. The Government discussed the principles behind its policies, namely meritocracy, secularism and a multiracial approach. Relations between communities are encouraged and promoted through social services, such as public housing programmes, schools and national service, which are accessible to all.

92. Article 12 of the Constitution states that there is to be no discrimination against citizens of Singapore on the grounds of religion, race, descent or place of birth and especially when it concerns the right to education (art. 16). Article 152 mandates the Government to care for the interests of racial and religious minorities in Singapore.

93. The Presidential Council for Minority Rights scrutinizes proposed legislation in order to ensure that new laws will not discriminate against ethnic or religious minorities. Section 4 of the Undesirable Publications Act prevents the sale or circulation of objectionable publications likely to cause hostility between racial or religious groups. Section 4 (1) of the Sedition Act (chap. 290 of the statutes of Singapore) criminalizes seditious tendencies, including the tendency to promote hostility between races.

94. An ethnic quota scheme for public housing prevents segregation, while compulsory military service brings together young men from various races and religions. The electoral system for the legislature is based on a group representation constituency scheme, whereby members are elected in groups and each group must

include at least one ethnic minority. In addition, community development councils function as local administrations in each of the five main districts of Singapore, planning and supporting programmes that promote community bonding and social cohesion.

95. The community engagement programme seeks to develop networks of trust across communities in Singapore. Under the programme, a national steering committee on racial and religious harmony was established to give ethnic and religious leaders a national platform where they could meet in order to strengthen interaction and engagement between their communities. Interracial and religious confidence circles undertake parallel work at the local level.

N. Spain

96. The Government referenced its comprehensive strategy against racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance, which covers several aspects of resolution 67/154. The strategy includes a data-gathering system on racist incidents and the training of civil servants and law enforcement authorities on the appropriate handling of such incidents. To date, 2,690 officers from the civil guard, the national police force, the autonomous community police forces and local police forces have been trained.

97. The Council for the Promotion of Equal Treatment of All Persons without Discrimination on Grounds of Racial or Ethnic Origin adopted a proposal to avoid the use of discriminatory, racist or xenophobic speech in electoral campaigns.

98. The criminal code punishes various offences committed on discriminatory grounds and bodies that commit them, specifically torture committed by a public authority or official based on any discriminatory grounds (art. 174), discrimination in the workplace (art. 314), incitement to hatred, violence or discrimination (art. 510), refusal of public services by a civil servant, authority or individual (art. 511), refusal of benefits in the context of professional or business activities (art. 512), associations that are deemed unlawful for promoting or inciting hatred, violence or discrimination (art. 515.5) and dissemination of ideas justifying genocide (art. 607.2).

99. The Office of the Secretary-General for Immigration and Emigration includes extracurricular educational programmes promoting integration and intercultural interaction and helps to redress inequalities and special educational needs.

100. The comprehensive strategy against racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance also focuses on improving the skills of social workers and anti-discrimination professionals.

101. The use of the Internet to disseminate racist and xenophobic ideas and actions is a cause of growing concern for Spain. It has appointed a special prosecutor on Internet-related crimes in all public prosecutors' offices throughout the country and established specialized units on Internet-related offences within the State security forces. In addition, the Office of the Secretary-General for Immigration and Emigration subsidizes Internet-based activities carried out by non-governmental organizations to combat racism.

O. Thailand

102. The Government focused on the protection, promotion and implementation of the rights guaranteed in the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination. During 2011 and 2012, the Government submitted and presented its first report to the Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination. It also disseminated the principles of the Convention through training sessions for government officials conducted by the Department for the Protection of Rights and Liberties under the Ministry of Justice.

103. The Government has disseminated and promoted the provisions of the Convention to the general population, especially through the Internet.

104. Government officials regularly visit each region in order to develop informed policies aimed at improving the quality of life of minorities.

P. Ukraine

105. The Government guarantees members of the various ethnic communities residing in its territory equal political, economic, social and cultural rights.

106. The new national migration policy framework aims to prevent racism, xenophobia and religious intolerance and encourage tolerance in society, in particular towards migrants.

107. The plan of action adopted by Order No. 1058-r of the Cabinet of Ministers (12 October 2011) provides measures to raise public awareness on cultural diversity and the way of life of migrants. In addition, a plan of action to build a more civic-minded culture and raise the level of tolerance in society was adopted in Order No. 236-r (25 April 2012). The plan provides for an extensive package of activities, including awareness-raising, improving legal understanding within society and the development of social dialogue and the promotion of cooperation with civil society on such issues.

108. As mandated by Presidential Decree No. 388/2011 (6 April 2011), the Ministry of Culture has focused considerable attention on stamping out racism and xenophobia in cooperation with regional and international mechanisms. Organizational and financial support has been provided for cultural, artistic, educational and scientific initiatives undertaken by ethnic cultural associations in various parts of the country to help to promote the traditions and cultures of all ethnic groups in Ukraine.

109. In accordance with Order No. 528 (25 May 2012), the Ministry of Culture has set up organizational units for the prevention of situations that could disrupt social and political stability or fuel ethnic, racial or religious enmity, through appropriate monitoring and awareness-raising activities.

110. State cultural institutions play an important role. For example, libraries and museums conduct educational work to foster tolerance and respect for the culture, language, customs and traditions of various ethnic groups.

111. Interfaith advisory bodies have a particularly positive role to play at the national level in forging relations between confessions. In that context, the work of the All-Ukrainian Council of Churches and Religious Organizations, composed of

members of the principal Christian churches of Ukraine, has a significant impact on interfaith relations, as have the heads of the ethnic religious centres operating in the country, including one Jewish and three Muslim centres. The efforts of the Council to strengthen harmony and tolerance among religious organizations of various faiths and their members have been effective, according to the Government.

III. Contributions received from intergovernmental, non-governmental and other organizations

A. European Union

112. In May 2013, the European Commission Directorate-General for Justice adopted its third annual report on the application of the Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union, covering the year 2012, which takes stock of manifestations of intolerance to pluralism in the European Union. In 2012 a number of serious incidents of racism and xenophobia took place in the European Union, including racist and xenophobic hate speech and violence against Roma and immigrants.

113. According to the findings of a report on crimes motivated by hatred and prejudice in the European Union by the European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights, nearly 1 in 5 Roma and sub-Saharan Africans interviewed considered that they had been a victim of a racially motivated crime of assault or had been threatened or seriously harassed at least once in the previous 12 months. Victims of crime are often unable or unwilling to seek redress against the perpetrators, however. For this reason, many crimes go unreported and unprosecuted, which illustrates the need to build up confidence in the criminal justice system and law enforcement bodies among victims and witnesses of hate crimes.

114. A Eurobarometer survey undertaken to assess discrimination in the European Union in 2012 showed that discrimination on the grounds of ethnic origin continued to be regarded as the most widespread form of discrimination.

115. The European Union is assessing the application of the anti-discrimination equality directive (2000/43/EC) and the employment equality directive (2000/78/EC) in order to look into existing challenges to their efficient implementation.

116. A report on the transposition of framework decision 2008/913/JHA of the Council of the European Union on combating certain forms and expressions of racism and xenophobia by means of criminal law will assess the compliance of member States with the provisions of the framework decision and could be used as a basis to address infringements of the decision by initiating the necessary procedures from 1 December 2014.

117. The proposal of the European Commission for a recommendation by the Council of Europe on Roma inclusion will be presented before the end of 2013. The aim of the recommendation is to reinforce the implementation of national Roma integration strategies by developing responses to a number of cross-cutting issues, such as the situation of Roma children, Roma women and transnational cooperation. In addition, the Commission has proposed better targeting of European Union funds to support Roma integration.

118. In an effort to combat anti-Semitism, the European Commission marked, for the second time, the International Day of Commemoration in memory of the victims of the Holocaust.

B. Council of Europe

119. Following a visit to Greece, the Commissioner for Human Rights of the Council of Europe provided a detailed submission in which he noted that, in addition to migrants, other social groups such as Roma, members of the Muslim minority of Turkish ethnic origin, lesbian, gay, bisexual and transgender persons and human rights defenders had been targeted through hate speech and violence.

120. The Commissioner reported on cases of ill-treatment, including torture, committed by law enforcement officers against migrants and Roma. Regrettably, rhetoric stigmatizing migrants has been widely used in Greek politics and immigration control measures have led to further stigmatization of migrants. In addition, access to justice and effective remedies for victims have been constrained by excessively lengthy judicial proceedings.

121. Reference was made to the newly established post of the anti-racism prosecutor in Athens, which needs particular reinforcement and expansion to other regions so that the anti-racism law is effectively applied throughout the country. It was further stated that the establishment of 70 new anti-racist units and a hotline for reporting racist incidents were welcome steps forward.

C. International Association of Jewish Lawyers and Jurists

122. Information was provided about the extreme right-wing party, Golden Dawn, which received 6.7 per cent of the votes in the recent national elections in Greece by promoting fascist and Nazi ideology, advocating violence and supporting attacks on vulnerable groups.

123. Attention was also drawn to incidents in which public figures made numerous anti-Semitic statements in various part of the world, including Eastern Europe and Latin America. In some of those statements, Jews were accused of practising ritual killings. In one country, parliamentarians have taken genetic tests to prove that they have no Jewish or Roma ancestors and a public demand was made by a parliamentarians that a list of all Jewish government officials be produced so that they could be distinguished as posing a national security risk.

D. German Institute for Human Rights

124. The national human rights institution emphasized the importance of penalizing the approval, denial or belittlement of the Holocaust in national law, given that denial could potentially promote racist ideologies and hence constitute hate speech under article 4 (a) of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination.

125. The Institute also noted that section 130 (3) of the German penal code penalizes the approval, denial or belittlement of the Holocaust.

E. Latvian Human Rights Committee

126. The non-governmental organization provided information on existing public and political support for a commemorative celebration of a national Waffen SS legion that fought alongside the Nazis. It is reported that annual marches continue to be held and attract several thousand participants. The marches are also reportedly attended and supported by politicians and high-ranking government officials.

127. In September 2012, a monument was opened in a Latvian city bearing the insignia of the Latvian legion of the Waffen SS with the inscription: "Latvia must be a country of ethnic Latvians". Criticism from civil society and the international community notwithstanding, the local authorities have refused to address the situation.

128. It was also indicated that cases of hate speech were not prosecuted in Latvia.

F. Social Action Centre/No Borders project

129. The non-governmental organization submitted information on Ukraine and reported that few efforts were made to investigate and prosecute hate crimes, including those against lesbian, gay, bisexual and transgender people. It was further indicated that Roma people, along with other minorities, were facing discrimination in their daily lives.

130. The non-governmental organization also mentioned the institutionalization of racism through the practice of racial profiling by the police and the repeated incidents of racially motivated police violence against minority groups, including undocumented migrants, asylum seekers and minorities. The lack of political will to tackle racism and xenophobia was emphasized.

G. Other submissions

131. Findings on 48 countries around the world were provided. It was noted that, over the past few years, a significant increase in discrimination and racism against certain groups has been observed in several countries.

132. Widespread and increasing discrimination against Roma communities is marked in seven countries of Eastern and Central Europe. Roma people are subjected to frequent hate crimes and attacks. In one country, the electoral law excludes Roma from standing for parliamentary and presidential elections. More than three years after the European Court of Human Rights found that law to be discriminatory, the Government concerned has failed to implement changes.

133. Increasing resentment against asylum seekers and refugees was found in several countries. In one, a law for the prevention of infiltration provides for the imprisonment of asylum seekers for multiple years. In some countries in Eastern and South-Eastern Africa, refugees and asylum seekers are particularly exposed to arrest and detention upon arrival and there has been extreme and widespread hostility toward foreigners. Some people are excluded from procedures for the determination of refugee status based on their ethnicity and are at risk of police harassment and deportation. Discrimination and intolerance against indigenous peoples are common in Latin America and some parts of the Middle East.

134. As a consequence of this scapegoating rhetoric, restrictive and punitive immigration and asylum policies are emerging in some countries. Such policies often provide for the detention of undocumented migrants and asylum seekers.

IV. Conclusions and recommendations

135. The Special Rapporteur is grateful to all States for the information provided on the measures implemented pursuant to General Assembly resolution 67/154. He also appreciates the contributions received from other organizations and civil society. He recalls the importance of full cooperation with his mandate as stipulated in Human Rights Council resolution 16/33.

136. The Special Rapporteur notes that some States referred in their replies to an increase in their territory of the phenomena identified in General Assembly resolution 67/154 and to the proliferation of extreme right-wing groups. Others stressed that no such phenomena existed within their borders. The Special Rapporteur wishes to emphasize that the human rights and democratic challenges posed by extremist political parties, movements and groups are universal and no country is immune from them. He calls upon States to increase their vigilance and be proactive in strengthening efforts and political will to recognize and effectively address them.

137. The Special Rapporteur wishes to stress that any commemorative celebration of the Nazi Waffen SS organization and its crimes against humanity, whether official or non-official, should be prohibited by States. The Special Rapporteur wishes to recall paragraph 9 of General Assembly resolution 67/154, which provides that such manifestations do injustice to the memory of the countless victims of crimes against humanity committed in the Second World War, in particular those committed by the SS organization and by those who fought against the anti-Hitler coalition and collaborated with the Nazi movement, and negatively influence children and young people, and that failure by States to effectively address such practices is incompatible with the obligations of States Members of the United Nations.

138. The Special Rapporteur welcomes the information provided regarding the ratification of a range of instruments, including the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination and its inclusion in national legal and constitutional frameworks. He urges those States that have not yet done so to ratify the Convention and make the declaration under its article 14, thus providing competence to the Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination to receive and consider communications from individuals or groups of individuals within its jurisdiction claiming to be victims of a violation by a State party of any of the rights set forth in this Convention. No communication can be received by the Committee if it concerns a State party that has not made such a declaration.

139. Several countries informed the Special Rapporteur that their constitutions and legislation enshrined the principles of equality and non-discrimination and prohibited incitement to racial, religious and national hatred. Furthermore, the Special Rapporteur notes that some countries have adopted legislation specifically to tackle the challenges posed by extremist political parties, movements and groups and have elaborated legal or constitutional provisions to

prohibit organizations and associations that incite discrimination, national, racial or religious hatred and violence and propagate fascist ideology.

140. The various programmes and activities coordinated at the national level to combat and prevent the spread of extremism in society are positively received by the Special Rapporteur. The recently witnessed strong measures taken in some countries to counter violent right-wing extremist groups posing a threat to vulnerable groups and national security are good practices that should be emulated while remaining within the scope of article 4 of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination and article 20 of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights.

141. The Special Rapporteur encourages States to adopt the legislation necessary to combat racism, while ensuring that the definition of racial discrimination complies with article 1 of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination. He calls for the modernization of national anti-racism legislation in the light of the increasingly open expression of hate speech and incitement to violence against vulnerable groups. In this regard, he recalls that any legislative or constitutional measures adopted with a view to countering extremist political parties, movements and groups, including neo-Nazis and skinhead groups and similar extremist ideological movements, should be in conformity with the relevant international human rights standards. He urges States to fully respect and implement their obligations under article 4 of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination and articles 19 to 22 of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights. It is also important that draft legislation be carefully reviewed by independent bodies so as to ensure that the rights of the most vulnerable are not affected, especially with regard to immigration laws.

142. The Special Rapporteur notes with appreciation that several States have prescribed in their criminal codes that racist and xenophobic motivation constitute an aggravating circumstance attracting heavier sanctions against not only instigators but also followers. In the light of the various reports of cases of hate speech that remain unpunished and the widespread impunity enjoyed by perpetrators, the Special Rapporteur wishes to emphasize that it is extremely dangerous to institutionalize impunity, given that this sends the wrong signal to perpetrators and weakens the rule of law. He reiterates the recommendation made in his report to the Human Rights Council ([A/HRC/23/24](#), para. 32) and calls upon States to fulfil their responsibility of bringing to justice the perpetrators of crimes with racist, xenophobic, anti-Semitic or homophobic motivation and to combat impunity. Any failure on the part of a State to fulfil these obligations represents a threat to the rule of law and democracy.

143. While welcoming the information provided regarding measures taken to prevent discrimination against members of minorities, people of African descent, Roma, migrants, refugees and asylum seekers and to ensure their integration into society, the Special Rapporteur wishes to urge States to ensure the full and effective implementation of legal, policy and institutional measures protecting these groups of individuals. The gap between the provisions of the legal and institutional framework and the challenges faced by these vulnerable groups, including with regard to racist and xenophobic acts from extremist

groups or individuals, remain of particular concern. The Special Rapporteur therefore recommends that States effectively guarantee to these groups, without discrimination of any kind, the right to security and access to justice, adequate reparation, legal aid and appropriate information about their rights, as well as the prosecution and adequate sanction of those responsible for racist crimes against them. In this respect, the Special Rapporteur wishes also to recall paragraph 88 of the Durban Declaration, which recognizes that the media should represent the diversity of a multicultural society and play a role in fighting racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance.

144. The Special Rapporteur remains deeply concerned about the confirmation of tendencies to scapegoat vulnerable groups, including migrants, asylum seekers and ethnic minorities, especially Roma. Scapegoating remains a powerful tool for politicians whose only goal is to mobilize the masses to the detriment of social cohesion and human rights. The continued blunt, uncensored and unpunished expressions of supremacist, anti-Semitic and hateful opinions by political leaders may be an indicator that societies are growing dangerously and increasingly tolerant of hate speech and extremist ideas. The Special Rapporteur wishes, once more, to stress that political leaders and parties have the responsibility to strongly and clearly condemn all messages that disseminate ideas based on racial superiority or hatred, incitement to racial discrimination or xenophobia. Political leaders have the moral duty to promote tolerance and respect and they should refrain from forming coalitions with extremist political parties of a racist or xenophobic character.

145. The Special Rapporteur note with interest and appreciation the institutional measures taken by States to tackle extremist, neo-Nazi and skinhead groups, including through the establishment of national institutions with a general human rights mandate or a specific mandate to combat racial discrimination and the competence to receive and consider complaints from individuals. Sufficient human and financial resources should be provided to these institutions, while fully respecting their independence in line with the principles relating to the status of national human rights institutions (General Assembly resolution [48/134](#)). The Special Rapporteur calls upon States that have yet to establish such institutions to remedy this situation.

146. The Special Rapporteur takes note of efforts made to document racially motivated crimes, especially the conduct of specialized studies and the assessment of existing programmes. These efforts remain marginal and localized, however. He reiterates the recommendation made in his report to the Human Rights Council ([A/HRC23/24](#), para. 33) on the collection of data and statistics. Disaggregated data are needed to understand the scope and nature of racism, xenophobia and all related intolerance within society. Such data are also valuable in designing and implementing effective policies to prevent and combat this scourge.

147. A number of positive initiatives have been identified in the replies of States, including awareness-raising activities to foster tolerance, respect for cultural diversity and mutual understanding. The Special Rapporteur is of the view that the organization of cultural events, research work, festivals, conferences, seminars, exhibitions and information campaigns are positive

measures that contribute to the building of a society based on pluralism, mutual understanding, tolerance and non-discrimination. He therefore encourages States to strengthen the implementation of such initiatives.

148. The Special Rapporteur welcomes efforts undertaken to train law enforcement agents, including the police, immigration officers, judges and lawyers, on human rights and non-discrimination. He notes, however, that ethnic profiling and police violence against vulnerable groups are recurring issues in several countries which discourage victims from seeking redress, owing to distrust of the legal system. He encourages States to adopt and strengthen measures to improve diversity within law enforcement agencies and impose appropriate sanctions against those within the public service found guilty of racially motivated violence or of using hate speech. The capacity of law enforcement officers should be improved so that they can better protect the rights of the most vulnerable groups and address occurrences of racially motivated crimes. There is a need for systematic, continuous training and awareness-raising on the anti-discrimination legal framework and practice for all law enforcement officers, prosecutors and judges and also immigration officials and border guards, where appropriate.

149. Some States provided information about the use of the Internet to foster a culture of peace and tolerance and to promote national legal provisions and protections against extremism, hate speech and xenophobia. The Special Rapporteur welcomes initiatives taken by some States to monitor the web pages of extremist groups and close them down when necessary. He further calls for the development of a solid legal framework regarding hate speech and extremist mobilization on the Internet. The Special Rapporteur welcomes the positive use of the Internet and recalls in this regard the relevant provisions of the Durban Declaration (para. 92), under which States recognize the need to promote the use of new information and communication technologies, including the Internet, to contribute to the fight against racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance. He further recommends the implementation of the recommendations made in his report to the General Assembly on racism and the Internet ([A/67/326](#)).

150. The Special Rapporteur welcomes the measures developed by some States to prevent the negative influence of extremist political parties, movements and groups on young people, including educational measures and courses aimed at raising the awareness of young children and developing their ability to interact in a multi-ethnic and multi-confessional environment. The Special Rapporteur recommends the increase of measures to raise awareness among young people of the dangers of the ideologies and activities of extremist political parties, movements and groups. In this regard, education in general, and human rights education in particular, remains a key tool in countering the influence of these ideologies among young people.

151. The Special Rapporteur notes with appreciation the emphasis put on human rights education in some replies by States. The Special Rapporteur recommends that States continue to invest in education, in both conventional and non-conventional curricula, in order to transform attitudes and correct ideas of racial hierarchies and superiority promoted by extremist political parties, movements and groups and counter their negative influence. He further

recommends cooperation with the United Nations Educational Scientific and Cultural Organization, including in the framework of the relevant programmes set up by the Organization regarding human rights education, racism and racial discrimination.

152. The Special Rapporteur welcomes information regarding coordination between governmental structures in order to maximize efforts on the issue of equality and non-discrimination and mainstream anti-discrimination policies in public sectors. He encourages such coordinated efforts and also recommends inclusion of a variety of actors, such as civil society actors, national human rights institutions and the media. He notes the good practice established by the cooperation between a national court and a social media outlet to bring to justice an individual found guilty of posting anti-Semitic messages on his profile.

153. The Special Rapporteur wishes to stress the role played by the media in combating the spread of extremist ideas. The media have a responsibility to combat stereotypes, promote a culture of tolerance and play an integrative role by providing space for ethnic minorities to also have their voice heard.

154. Furthermore, the Special Rapporteur welcomes initiatives taken to ensure cooperation at the regional level, including through seminars and conferences. They represent important venues for exchanging lessons learned and good practices, but also for identifying remaining challenges at the regional and international levels. The Special Rapporteur also welcomes the ratification of the relevant regional human rights instruments.
